

# Landau-Khalatnikov-Fradkin transformation and even $\zeta$ -values in Euclidean massless correlators

Sofian Teber

Sorbonne Université

Based on a work with Anatoly V. Kotikov (JINR, Dubna)

Phys. Rev. D **100**, no. 10, 105017 (2019) [arXiv:1906.10930 [hep-th]]

Rencontre de Physique des Particules 2020 - Ecole Polytechnique  
January 30, 2020



# Unexpected relation between

## The Landau-Khalatnikov-Fradkin (LKF) transformation

an elegant and powerful transformation allowing one to study the **gauge covariance** of Green's functions in gauge theories.

&

## The multi-loop structure of Euclidean massless correlators

subject to a mysterious **cancellation of even zeta-values**,  $\zeta_{2n}$ , e.g., of  $\pi^{2n}$ .

### Proof of the “no- $\pi$ theorem”

even  $\zeta$ -values can be absorbed in a redefinition of the transcendental basis, *i.e.*, the so-called hatted  $\zeta$ -values,  $\hat{\zeta}_{2n+1}$

# Outline

- 1 Introduction
- 2 Proof
- 3 Conclusion

# Outline

1 Introduction

2 Proof

3 Conclusion

# The LKF transformation (LKFT)

In its original form [Landau and Khalatnikov '55, Fradkin '55]

Relates the QED fermion propagator in two different  $\xi$ -gauges

$$S_F(x, \xi) = S_F(x, \eta) e^{D(x) - D(0)}, \quad D(x) = \Delta e^2 \int \frac{d^4 p}{(2\pi)^4} \frac{e^{-ipx}}{p^4}, \quad \Delta = \xi - \eta$$

Other important works (including generalizations to higher point functions):  
[Johnson & Zumino '59; Zumino '60; Okubo '60; Bialynicki-Birula '60; Sonoda '01]

Physical quantities should not depend on gauge-fixing parameters  $\xi$  and  $\eta$

Control over gauge dependence & **precious information** can be obtained  
by studying the gauge-covariance of correlation functions

Extensively used for decades

# The LKF transformation (LKFT)

In its original form [Landau and Khalatnikov '55, Fradkin '55]

Relates the QED fermion propagator in two different  $\xi$ -gauges

$$S_F(x, \xi) = S_F(x, \eta) e^{D(x) - D(0)}, \quad D(x) = \Delta e^2 \int \frac{d^4 p}{(2\pi)^4} \frac{e^{-ipx}}{p^4}, \quad \Delta = \xi - \eta$$

Most important (recent) applications:

- gauge-covariance of Schwinger-Dyson equations  
[Curtis & Pennington '90; Dong, Munczek & Roberts '94, '96; Bashir, Kizilersu & Pennington '98, '00; Burden & Tjiang '98; Jia & Pennington '16, '17; ... ]
- estimation of large orders of perturbation theory (**non-perturbative**)  
[Bashir and Raya '02, Jia & Pennington '17; ...]
- generalization brane-worlds  
[Ahmad et al. '16; James, Kotikov & ST '19]
- generalization to  $SU(N)$  gauge theories [De Meerleer et al. '18, '19]

## Multi-loop structure of Euclidean massless correlators

We focus on **propagator-type** (p-type) functions:  $\overline{\text{MS}}$ -renormalized Euclidean 2-point functions (possible IRR) expressible in terms of massless p-type Feynman integrals (p-integrals or master integrals).

### Mysterious cancellations of even $\zeta$ -values, $\zeta_{2n}$ , e.g., of $\pi^{2n}$

Observations (pQCD p-type functions):

- **30 years ago:** all contributions proportional to  $\zeta_4 = \pi^4/90$  cancel out in the Adler function at three-loops [Gorishnii, Kataev & Larin '91]
- **10 years ago:** **four-loop** contribution is also  $\pi$ -free and a similar fact holds for the coefficient function of the Bjorken sum rule [Baikov, Chetyrkin & Kühn '10]
- **recent years:** increasing evidence for other quantities [Jamin et al. '18; Davies & Vogt '18; Ruijl et al. '18; Vogt et al. '18; Baikov et al. '18; Moch et al. '18; Herzog et al. '18, '19; Baikov et al. '19]

**Note:** first appearance of  $\zeta_4$  in some 5-loop correlators (e.g.,  $\beta_{\text{QCD}}$ )

## “no- $\pi$ theorem” [Broadhurst '99; Baikov & Chetyrkin '18]

Regularity in terms proportional to  $\pi^{2n}$  explained by *observing* that the  $\varepsilon$ -dependent ( $d = 4 - 2\varepsilon$ ) transformation of  $\zeta$ -values

$$\hat{\zeta}_3 \equiv \zeta_3 + \frac{3\varepsilon}{2}\zeta_4 - \frac{5\varepsilon^3}{2}\zeta_6, \quad \hat{\zeta}_5 \equiv \zeta_5 + \frac{5\varepsilon}{2}\zeta_6, \quad \hat{\zeta}_7 \equiv \zeta_7, \quad \dots \quad (1)$$

Eliminates even zetas from the loop expansion of p-integrals/-functions  
Defines the existence of a **hatted transcendental basis**

Recently:

- Eq. (1) has been generalized to 5- and 6-loop p-integrals [Baikov & Chetyrkin '18; Georgoudis et al. '18]
- Eq. (1) has been generalized to 7-loop p-integrals [Baikov & Chetyrkin '19]
- results [Baikov & Chetyrkin '18, '19; Georgoudis et al. '18] also display **multi- $\hat{\zeta}$  values**

## “no- $\pi$ theorem” [Broadhurst '99; Baikov & Chetyrkin '18]

Regularity in terms proportional to  $\pi^{2n}$  explained by *observing* that the  $\varepsilon$ -dependent ( $d = 4 - 2\varepsilon$ ) transformation of  $\zeta$ -values

$$\hat{\zeta}_3 \equiv \zeta_3 + \frac{3\varepsilon}{2}\zeta_4 - \frac{5\varepsilon^3}{2}\zeta_6, \quad \hat{\zeta}_5 \equiv \zeta_5 + \frac{5\varepsilon}{2}\zeta_6, \quad \hat{\zeta}_7 \equiv \zeta_7, \quad \dots \quad (1)$$

Eliminates even zetas from the loop expansion of p-integrals/-functions  
Defines the existence of a **hatted transcendental basis**

### Our work: **proof of the no- $\pi$ theorem**

- using the LKFT, we generalize (1) **to all orders in perturbation theory**.
- note: we find the **one-fold set of  $\hat{\zeta}$ -values** (no multi- $\hat{\zeta}$  values).  
(the LKFT involves only products of  $\Gamma$ -functions)

# View of first terms generated by our exact result

In blue: terms known from [Baikov & Chetyrkin '18] (up to 6 loops).

In red: terms known from [Baikov & Chetyrkin '19] (7 loop).

$$\begin{aligned}\hat{\zeta}_3 &= \zeta_3 + \frac{3\epsilon}{2} \zeta_4 - \frac{5\epsilon^3}{2} \zeta_6 + \frac{21\epsilon^5}{2} \zeta_8 - \frac{153\epsilon^7}{2} \zeta_{10} + \frac{1705\epsilon^9}{2} \zeta_{12} - \frac{26949\epsilon^{11}}{2} \zeta_{14} + \frac{573405\epsilon^{13}}{2} \zeta_{16} - \\ &\quad - \frac{15802673\epsilon^{15}}{2} \zeta_{18} + \frac{547591761\epsilon^{17}}{2} \zeta_{20} - \frac{23302711005\epsilon^{19}}{2} \zeta_{22} + \frac{1194695479813\epsilon^{21}}{2} \zeta_{24} + \dots \\ \hat{\zeta}_5 &= \zeta_5 + \frac{5\epsilon}{2} \zeta_6 - \frac{35\epsilon^3}{4} \zeta_8 + 63\epsilon^5 \zeta_{10} - \frac{2805\epsilon^7}{4} \zeta_{12} + \frac{22165\epsilon^9}{2} \zeta_{14} - \frac{943215\epsilon^{11}}{4} \zeta_{16} + 6498590\epsilon^{13} \zeta_{18} - \\ &\quad - \frac{900752361\epsilon^{15}}{4} \zeta_{20} + \frac{19165711635\epsilon^{17}}{2} \zeta_{22} - \frac{1965195294755\epsilon^{19}}{4} \zeta_{24} + 29867386995325\epsilon^{21} \zeta_{26} + \dots \\ \hat{\zeta}_7 &= \zeta_7 + \frac{7\epsilon}{2} \zeta_8 - 21\epsilon^3 \zeta_{10} + 231\epsilon^5 \zeta_{12} - \frac{7293\epsilon^7}{2} \zeta_{14} + \frac{155155\epsilon^9}{2} \zeta_{16} - 2137954\epsilon^{11} \zeta_{18} + 74083926\epsilon^{13} \zeta_{20} + \dots \\ \hat{\zeta}_9 &= \zeta_9 + \frac{9\epsilon}{2} \zeta_{10} - \frac{165\epsilon^3}{4} \zeta_{12} + \frac{1287\epsilon^5}{2} \zeta_{14} - \frac{109395\epsilon^7}{8} \zeta_{16} + 376805\epsilon^9 \zeta_{18} - \frac{26113581\epsilon^{11}}{2} \zeta_{20} + \dots \\ \hat{\zeta}_{11} &= \zeta_{11} + \frac{11\epsilon}{2} \zeta_{12} - \frac{143\epsilon^3}{2} \zeta_{14} + \frac{3003\epsilon^5}{2} \zeta_{16} - 41327\epsilon^7 \zeta_{18} + 1431859\epsilon^9 \zeta_{20} - 60931689\epsilon^{11} \zeta_{22} + \dots \\ \hat{\zeta}_{13} &= \zeta_{13} + \frac{13\epsilon}{2} \zeta_{14} - \frac{455\epsilon^3}{4} \zeta_{16} + 3094\epsilon^5 \zeta_{18} - \frac{214149\epsilon^7}{2} \zeta_{20} + 4555915\epsilon^9 \zeta_{22} - \frac{467142949\epsilon^{11}}{2} \zeta_{24} + \dots \\ \hat{\zeta}_{15} &= \zeta_{15} + \frac{15\epsilon}{2} \zeta_{16} - 170\epsilon^3 \zeta_{18} + 5814\epsilon^5 \zeta_{20} - 247095\epsilon^7 \zeta_{22} + 12666445\epsilon^9 \zeta_{24} - 770015850\epsilon^{11} \zeta_{26} + \dots\end{aligned}$$

These results provide stringent constraints on multi-loop calculations

# View of first terms generated by our exact result

In blue: terms known from [Baikov & Chetyrkin '18] (up to 6 loops).

In red: terms known from [Baikov & Chetyrkin '19] (7 loop).

$$\begin{aligned}\hat{\zeta}_3 &= \zeta_3 + \frac{3\varepsilon}{2} \zeta_4 - \frac{5\varepsilon^3}{2} \zeta_6 + \frac{21\varepsilon^5}{2} \zeta_8 - \frac{153\varepsilon^7}{2} \zeta_{10} + \frac{1705\varepsilon^9}{2} \zeta_{12} - \frac{26949\varepsilon^{11}}{2} \zeta_{14} + \frac{573405\varepsilon^{13}}{2} \zeta_{16} - \\ &\quad - \frac{15802673\varepsilon^{15}}{2} \zeta_{18} + \frac{547591761\varepsilon^{17}}{2} \zeta_{20} - \frac{23302711005\varepsilon^{19}}{2} \zeta_{22} + \frac{1194695479813\varepsilon^{21}}{2} \zeta_{24} + \dots \\ \hat{\zeta}_5 &= \zeta_5 + \frac{5\varepsilon}{2} \zeta_6 - \frac{35\varepsilon^3}{4} \zeta_8 + 63\varepsilon^5 \zeta_{10} - \frac{2805\varepsilon^7}{4} \zeta_{12} + \frac{22165\varepsilon^9}{2} \zeta_{14} - \frac{943215\varepsilon^{11}}{4} \zeta_{16} + 6498590\varepsilon^{13} \zeta_{18} - \\ &\quad - \frac{900752361\varepsilon^{15}}{4} \zeta_{20} + \frac{19165711635\varepsilon^{17}}{2} \zeta_{22} - \frac{1965195294755\varepsilon^{19}}{4} \zeta_{24} + 29867386995325\varepsilon^{21} \zeta_{26} + \dots \\ \hat{\zeta}_7 &= \zeta_7 + \frac{7\varepsilon}{2} \zeta_8 - 21\varepsilon^3 \zeta_{10} + 231\varepsilon^5 \zeta_{12} - \frac{7293\varepsilon^7}{2} \zeta_{14} + \frac{155155\varepsilon^9}{2} \zeta_{16} - 2137954\varepsilon^{11} \zeta_{18} + 74083926\varepsilon^{13} \zeta_{20} + \dots \\ \hat{\zeta}_9 &= \zeta_9 + \frac{9\varepsilon}{2} \zeta_{10} - \frac{165\varepsilon^3}{4} \zeta_{12} + \frac{1287\varepsilon^5}{2} \zeta_{14} - \frac{109395\varepsilon^7}{8} \zeta_{16} + 376805\varepsilon^9 \zeta_{18} - \frac{26113581\varepsilon^{11}}{2} \zeta_{20} + \dots \\ \hat{\zeta}_{11} &= \zeta_{11} + \frac{11\varepsilon}{2} \zeta_{12} - \frac{143\varepsilon^3}{2} \zeta_{14} + \frac{3003\varepsilon^5}{2} \zeta_{16} - 41327\varepsilon^7 \zeta_{18} + 1431859\varepsilon^9 \zeta_{20} - 60931689\varepsilon^{11} \zeta_{22} + \dots \\ \hat{\zeta}_{13} &= \zeta_{13} + \frac{13\varepsilon}{2} \zeta_{14} - \frac{455\varepsilon^3}{4} \zeta_{16} + 3094\varepsilon^5 \zeta_{18} - \frac{214149\varepsilon^7}{2} \zeta_{20} + 4555915\varepsilon^9 \zeta_{22} - \frac{467142949\varepsilon^{11}}{2} \zeta_{24} + \dots \\ \hat{\zeta}_{15} &= \zeta_{15} + \frac{15\varepsilon}{2} \zeta_{16} - 170\varepsilon^3 \zeta_{18} + 5814\varepsilon^5 \zeta_{20} - 247095\varepsilon^7 \zeta_{22} + 12666445\varepsilon^9 \zeta_{24} - 770015850\varepsilon^{11} \zeta_{26} + \dots\end{aligned}$$

These results provide stringent constraints on multi-loop calculations

# Outline

1 Introduction

2 Proof

3 Conclusion

## LKFT in dimensional regularization ( $d = 4 - 2\varepsilon$ )

$$S_F(x, \xi) = S_F(x, \eta) e^{D(x) - D(0)}, \quad D(x) = \Delta e^2 \int \frac{d^d p}{(2\pi)^d} \frac{e^{-ipx}}{p^4}, \quad \Delta = \xi - \eta$$

**Massless** fermion propagator in some gauge  $\xi$ :

$$S_F(p, \xi) = \frac{1}{i\hat{p}} P(p, \xi), \quad S_F(x, \xi) = \hat{x} X(x, \xi),$$

where  $P(p, \xi)$  and  $X(x, \xi)$  are scalar functions.

Representations related by  $d$ -dimensional Fourier transform:

$$S_F(p, \xi) = \int \frac{d^d x}{(2\pi)^{d/2}} e^{ipx} S_F(x, \xi), \quad S_F(x, \xi) = \int \frac{d^d p}{(2\pi)^{d/2}} e^{-ipx} S_F(p, \xi).$$

Techniques for **massless Feynman integral calculations** [Kotikov & ST '19]

## LKFT in dimensional regularization ( $d = 4 - 2\varepsilon$ )

$$S_F(x, \xi) = S_F(x, \eta) e^{D(x) - D(0)}, \quad D(x) = \Delta e^2 \int \frac{d^d p}{(2\pi)^d} \frac{e^{-ipx}}{p^4}, \quad \Delta = \xi - \eta$$

Techniques for **massless Feynman integral calculations** [Kotikov & ST '19]:

$$D(x) = -i \Delta e^2 (\mu^2 x^2)^{2-d/2} \frac{\Gamma(d/2 - 2)}{2^4 (\pi)^{d/2}}, \quad D(0) = 0,$$

because  $D(0)$  is a **massless tadpole** (no-scale integral).

## Position-space LKFT in dimensional regularization ( $d = 4 - 2\varepsilon$ )

$$S_F(x, \xi) = S_F(x, \eta) e^{iD(x)}$$

$$D(x) = \frac{i \Delta A}{\varepsilon} \Gamma(1 - \varepsilon) (\pi \mu^2 x^2)^\varepsilon, \quad A = \frac{\alpha_{\text{em}}}{4\pi} = \frac{e^2}{(4\pi)^2}$$

Let in some gauge  $\eta$  ( $\eta = 0$  in the Landau gauge):

$$P(p, \eta) = \sum_{m=0}^{\infty} a_m(\eta) A^m \left( \frac{\tilde{\mu}^2}{p^2} \right)^{m\epsilon}$$

where  $a_m(\eta)$  are coefficients of the loop expansion of the propagator and

$$\tilde{\mu}^2 = 4\pi\mu^2 \quad (\bar{\mu}^2 = \tilde{\mu}^2 e^{-\gamma} \overline{\text{MS-scale}})$$

the renormalization scale

### Momentum-space LKFT in dimensional regularization (I)

For another gauge  $\xi$ , the fermion propagator can be expressed as:

$$P(p, \xi) = \sum_{m=0}^{\infty} a_m(\xi) A^m \left( \frac{\tilde{\mu}^2}{p^2} \right)^{m\epsilon}$$

where

$$a_m(\xi) = a_m(\eta) \frac{\Gamma(2 - (m+1)\epsilon)}{\Gamma(1 + m\epsilon)} \times \\ \times \sum_{l=0}^{\infty} \frac{\Gamma(1 + (m+l)\epsilon) \Gamma^l(1 - \epsilon)}{l! \Gamma(2 - (m+l+1)\epsilon)} \frac{(\Delta A)^l}{(-\epsilon)^l} \left( \frac{\tilde{\mu}^2}{p^2} \right)^{l\epsilon}$$

Let in some gauge  $\eta$  ( $\eta = 0$  in the Landau gauge):

$$P(p, \eta) = \sum_{m=0}^{\infty} a_m(\eta) A^m \left( \frac{\tilde{\mu}^2}{p^2} \right)^{m\epsilon}$$

where  $a_m(\eta)$  are coefficients of the loop expansion of the propagator and

$$\tilde{\mu}^2 = 4\pi\mu^2 \quad (\bar{\mu}^2 = \tilde{\mu}^2 e^{-\gamma} \overline{\text{MS-scale}})$$

the renormalization scale

### Momentum-space LKFT in dimensional regularization (I)

For another gauge  $\xi$ , the fermion propagator can be expressed as:

$$P(p, \xi) = \sum_{m=0}^{\infty} a_m(\xi) A^m \left( \frac{\tilde{\mu}^2}{p^2} \right)^{m\epsilon}$$

where

$$a_m(\xi) = a_m(\eta) \frac{\Gamma(2 - (m+1)\epsilon)}{\Gamma(1 + m\epsilon)} \times \\ \times \sum_{l=0}^{\infty} \frac{\Gamma(1 + (m+l)\epsilon) \Gamma^l(1 - \epsilon)}{l! \Gamma(2 - (m+l+1)\epsilon)} \frac{(\Delta A)^l}{(-\epsilon)^l} \left( \frac{\tilde{\mu}^2}{p^2} \right)^{l\epsilon}$$

# Scale fixing (appropriate choice is crucial)

We work in MS-like schemes

- Popular  $\overline{\text{MS}}$ -scale: subtracts Euler- $\gamma$ .
- Popular  $G$ -scale [Chetyrkin, Kataev & Tkachov '80]: subtracts Euler- $\gamma$  and  $\zeta_2$

We use (for uniform transcendental weight):

- minimal Vladimirov-scale (MV-scale): new scale based on old calculations of [Vladimirov '79] (it has been used once in [Kataev & Vardiashvili '88])

$$\mu_{\text{MV}}^{2\varepsilon} = \frac{\tilde{\mu}^{2\varepsilon}}{\Gamma(1 - \varepsilon)}$$

The MV-scale is **the most efficient** for our calculations

- $g$ -scale [Broadhurst '99] (small variant of  $G$ -scale)

$$\mu_g^{2\varepsilon} = \tilde{\mu}^{2\varepsilon} \frac{\Gamma^2(1 - \varepsilon)\Gamma(1 + \varepsilon)}{\Gamma(1 - 2\varepsilon)}$$

# Scale fixing (appropriate choice is crucial)

We work in MS-like schemes

- Popular  $\overline{\text{MS}}$ -scale: subtracts Euler- $\gamma$ .
- Popular  $G$ -scale [Chetyrkin, Kataev & Tkachov '80]: subtracts Euler- $\gamma$  and  $\zeta_2$

We use (for uniform transcendental weight):

- **minimal Vladimirov-scale (MV-scale)**: new scale based on old calculations of [Vladimirov '79] (it has been used once in [Kataev & Vardiashvili '88])

$$\mu_{\text{MV}}^{2\varepsilon} = \frac{\tilde{\mu}^{2\varepsilon}}{\Gamma(1 - \varepsilon)}$$

The MV-scale is **the most efficient** for our calculations

- $g$ -scale [Broadhurst '99] (small variant of  $G$ -scale)

$$\mu_g^{2\varepsilon} = \tilde{\mu}^{2\varepsilon} \frac{\Gamma^2(1 - \varepsilon)\Gamma(1 + \varepsilon)}{\Gamma(1 - 2\varepsilon)}$$

## Momentum-space LKFT in dimensional regularization (II)

In both the MV-scale and  $g$ -scales ( $p = MV, g$ ):

$$a_m(\xi) = a_m(\eta) \sum_{l=0}^{\infty} \frac{1 - (m+1)\varepsilon}{1 - (m+l+1)\varepsilon} \Phi_p(m, l, \varepsilon) \frac{(\Delta A)^l}{(-\varepsilon)^l l!} \left( \frac{\mu_p^2}{p^2} \right)^{l\varepsilon}$$

$$\Phi_{MV}(m, l, \varepsilon) = \frac{\Gamma(1 - (m+1)\varepsilon) \Gamma(1 + (m+l)\varepsilon) \Gamma^{2l}(1 - \varepsilon)}{\Gamma(1 + m\varepsilon) \Gamma(1 - (m+l+1)\varepsilon)}$$

$$\Phi_g(m, l, \varepsilon) = \Phi_{MV}(m, l, \varepsilon) \frac{\Gamma^l(1 - 2\varepsilon)}{\Gamma^{3l}(1 - \varepsilon) \Gamma^l(1 + \varepsilon)}$$

The  $\Phi_p$ -functions can be expressed as expansions in  $\zeta_i$  ( $i \geq 3$ ) using

$$\Gamma(1 + \beta\varepsilon) = \exp \left[ -\gamma\beta\varepsilon + \sum_{s=2}^{\infty} (-1)^s \eta_s \beta^s \varepsilon^s \right], \quad \eta_s = \frac{\zeta_s}{s}$$

## Momentum-space LKFT in dimensional regularization (III)

In the **MV-scale**:

$$a_m(\xi) = a_m(\eta) \sum_{l=0}^{\infty} \frac{1 - (m+1)\varepsilon}{1 - (m+l+1)\varepsilon} \Phi_{\text{MV}}(m, l, \varepsilon) \frac{(\Delta A)^l}{(-\varepsilon)^l l!} \left( \frac{\mu_{\text{MV}}^2}{p^2} \right)^{l\varepsilon}$$

$$\Phi_{\text{MV}}(m, l, \varepsilon) = \exp \left[ \sum_{s=3}^{\infty} \eta_s p_s(m, l) \varepsilon^s \right] \quad \eta_s = \frac{\zeta_s}{s}$$

$$p_s(m, l) = (m+1)^s - (m+l+1)^s + 2l + (-1)^s \left\{ (m+l)^s - m^s \right\}$$

$$p_1(m, l) = 0, \quad p_2(m, l) = 0$$

**Notice:**  $\Phi_{\text{MV}}(m, l, \varepsilon)$  contains  $\zeta_s$ -function values of a given weight (or transcendental level)  $s$  in factor of  $\varepsilon^s$ .

**property of uniform transcendentality** [Kotikov & Lipatov '00]

For applications see, e.g., [Kotikov & Lipatov '02; Fleischer et al. '98; Kotikov et al. '07; Bajnok et al. '09; Lukowski et al. '10; Marboe et al. '15; Dixon et al. '19; Broedel et al. '19]

## Polynomials $p_s(m, l)$

$$p_s(m, l) = (m+1)^s - (m+l+1)^s + 2l + (-1)^s \left\{ (m+l)^s - m^s \right\}$$

$$p_1(m, l) = 0, \quad p_2(m, l) = 0$$

Conveniently separated in even and odd  $s$  values. **Recursion relations:**

$$p_{2k} = p_{2k-1} + Lp_{2k-2} + p_3, \quad L = l(l+1)$$

$$p_{2k-1} = p_{2k-2} + Lp_{2k-3} + p_3$$

**simple form holds in the MV-scheme** (more complicated otherwise)

$p_s$  takes the form of a polynomial in  $L$  in factor of  $p_3$ :

$$p_4 = 2p_3,$$

$$p_5 = p_4 + Lp_3 + p_3 = (3+L)p_3,$$

$$p_6 = p_5 + Lp_4 + p_3 = (4+3L)p_3,$$

Possible to eliminate  $L$ :

$$Lp_3 = p_5 - 3p_3, \quad p_6 = 3p_5 - 5p_3,$$

**Key fact:** even polynomials are entirely expressible in terms of odd ones

Generalize to arbitrary  $k$ :

$$p_{2k} = \sum_{s=2}^k p_{2s-1} C_{2k,2s-1} = \sum_{m=1}^{k-1} p_{2k-2m+1} C_{2k,2k-2m+1},$$

where the coefficients have the following structure

$$C_{2k,2k-2m+1} = b_{2m-1} \frac{(2k)!}{(2m-1)!(2k-2m+1)!}$$

The first few values read:

$$\begin{aligned} b_1 &= \frac{1}{2}, & b_3 &= -\frac{1}{4}, & b_5 &= \frac{1}{2}, & b_7 &= -\frac{17}{2}, & b_9 &= \frac{31}{2}, \\ b_{11} &= -\frac{691}{4}, & b_{13} &= \frac{5461}{2}, & b_{15} &= -\frac{929569}{16}, \\ b_{17} &= \frac{3202291}{2}, & b_{19} &= -\frac{221930581}{4}, \\ b_{21} &= \frac{4722116521}{2}, & b_{23} &= -\frac{968383680827}{8}. \end{aligned}$$

Looks like they are proportional to the numerators of Bernoulli numbers!

Generalize to arbitrary  $k$ :

$$p_{2k} = \sum_{s=2}^k p_{2s-1} C_{2k,2s-1} = \sum_{m=1}^{k-1} p_{2k-2m+1} C_{2k,2k-2m+1},$$

where the coefficients have the following structure

$$C_{2k,2k-2m+1} = b_{2m-1} \frac{(2k)!}{(2m-1)!(2k-2m+1)!}$$

Closer inspection reveals relation with **zero values of Euler polynomials**:

$$b_{2m-1} = -E_{2m-1}(x=0)$$

and therefore to **Bernoulli,  $B_m$ , and Genocchi,  $G_m$ , numbers** because

$$E_{2m-1}(x=0) = \frac{G_{2m}}{2m}, \quad G_{2m} = -\frac{(2^{2m}-1)}{m} B_{2m}$$

Hence:

$$b_{2m-1} = \frac{(2^{2m}-1)}{m} B_{2m}$$

## Hatted $\zeta$ -values

At this point, we may reconsider:

$$\Phi_{MV}(m, l, \varepsilon) = \exp \left[ \sum_{s=3}^{\infty} \eta_s p_s(m, l) \varepsilon^s \right] \quad \eta_s = \frac{\zeta_s}{s}$$

and perform the decomposition:

$$\sum_{s=3}^{\infty} \eta_s p_s \varepsilon^s = \sum_{k=2}^{\infty} \eta_{2k} p_{2k} \varepsilon^{2k} + \sum_{k=2}^{\infty} \eta_{2k-1} p_{2k-1} \varepsilon^{2k-1}.$$

Then

$$\sum_{k=2}^{\infty} \eta_{2k} p_{2k} \varepsilon^{2k} = \sum_{s=2}^{\infty} p_{2s-1} \sum_{k=s}^{\infty} \eta_{2k} c_{2k, 2s-1} \varepsilon^{2k}.$$

## Hatted $\zeta$ -values

At this point, we may reconsider:

$$\Phi_{MV}(m, l, \varepsilon) = \exp \left[ \sum_{s=3}^{\infty} \eta_s p_s(m, l) \varepsilon^s \right] \quad \eta_s = \frac{\zeta_s}{s}$$

and perform the decomposition:

$$\sum_{s=3}^{\infty} \eta_s p_s \varepsilon^s = \sum_{k=2}^{\infty} \eta_{2k} p_{2k} \varepsilon^{2k} + \sum_{k=2}^{\infty} \eta_{2k-1} p_{2k-1} \varepsilon^{2k-1}.$$

Then

$$\sum_{k=2}^{\infty} \eta_{2k} p_{2k} \varepsilon^{2k} = \sum_{s=2}^{\infty} p_{2s-1} \sum_{k=s}^{\infty} \eta_{2k} C_{2k, 2s-1} \varepsilon^{2k}.$$

Hence:

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{s=3}^{\infty} \eta_s p_s(m, l) \varepsilon^s &= \sum_{s=2}^{\infty} \hat{\eta}_{2s-1} p_{2s-1} \varepsilon^{2s-1} \\ \hat{\eta}_{2s-1} &= \eta_{2s-1} + \sum_{k=s}^{\infty} \eta_{2k} C_{2k, 2s-1} \varepsilon^{2(k-s)+1} \end{aligned}$$

## Hatted $\zeta$ -values

At this point, we may reconsider:

$$\Phi_{MV}(m, l, \varepsilon) = \exp \left[ \sum_{s=3}^{\infty} \eta_s p_s(m, l) \varepsilon^s \right] \quad \eta_s = \frac{\zeta_s}{s}$$

and perform the decomposition:

$$\sum_{s=3}^{\infty} \eta_s p_s \varepsilon^s = \sum_{k=2}^{\infty} \eta_{2k} p_{2k} \varepsilon^{2k} + \sum_{k=2}^{\infty} \eta_{2k-1} p_{2k-1} \varepsilon^{2k-1}.$$

Then

$$\sum_{k=2}^{\infty} \eta_{2k} p_{2k} \varepsilon^{2k} = \sum_{s=2}^{\infty} p_{2s-1} \sum_{k=s}^{\infty} \eta_{2k} C_{2k, 2s-1} \varepsilon^{2k}.$$

Hence:

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{s=3}^{\infty} \eta_s p_s(m, l) \varepsilon^s &= \sum_{s=2}^{\infty} \hat{\eta}_{2s-1} p_{2s-1} \varepsilon^{2s-1} \\ \hat{\eta}_{2s-1} &= \eta_{2s-1} + \sum_{k=s}^{\infty} \eta_{2k} C_{2k, 2s-1} \varepsilon^{2(k-s)+1} \end{aligned}$$

## Hatted $\zeta$ -values

“no- $\pi$  theorem” [Broadhurst '99; Baikov & Chetyrkin '18]

Final exact analytical expression [Kotikov & ST '19]:

$$\Phi_{\text{MV}}(m, l, \varepsilon) = \exp \left[ \sum_{s=2}^{\infty} \frac{\hat{\zeta}_{2s-1}}{2s-1} p_{2s-1} \varepsilon^{2s-1} \right]$$

$$\hat{\zeta}_{2s-1} = \zeta_{2s-1} + \sum_{k=s}^{\infty} \zeta_{2k} \hat{C}_{2k,2s-1} \varepsilon^{2(k-s)+1}$$

$$\hat{C}_{2k,2s-1} = \frac{2s-1}{2k} C_{2k,2s-1} = b_{2k-2s+1} \frac{(2k-1)!}{(2s-2)! (2k-2s+1)!}$$

$$b_{2m-1} = \frac{(2^{2m}-1)}{m} B_{2m}$$

Note 1: identical hatted  $\zeta$ -values found for the  $g$ -scale [Kotikov & ST '19]

## Hatted $\zeta$ -values

“no- $\pi$  theorem” [Broadhurst '99; Baikov & Chetyrkin '18]

Final exact analytical expression [Kotikov & ST '19]:

$$\Phi_{\text{MV}}(m, l, \varepsilon) = \exp \left[ \sum_{s=2}^{\infty} \frac{\hat{\zeta}_{2s-1}}{2s-1} p_{2s-1} \varepsilon^{2s-1} \right]$$

$$\hat{\zeta}_{2s-1} = \zeta_{2s-1} + \sum_{k=s}^{\infty} \zeta_{2k} \hat{C}_{2k, 2s-1} \varepsilon^{2(k-s)+1}$$

$$\hat{C}_{2k, 2s-1} = \frac{2s-1}{2k} C_{2k, 2s-1} = b_{2k-2s+1} \frac{(2k-1)!}{(2s-2)! (2k-2s+1)!}$$

$$b_{2m-1} = \frac{(2^{2m}-1)}{m} B_{2m}$$

**Note 1:** identical hatted  $\zeta$ -values found for the  $g$ -scale [Kotikov & ST '19]

**Note 2:** same basis found for scalar QED [Kotikov & ST '19]

## Hatted $\zeta$ -values

“no- $\pi$  theorem” [Broadhurst '99; Baikov & Chetyrkin '18]

Final exact analytical expression [Kotikov & ST '19]:

$$\Phi_{\text{MV}}(m, l, \varepsilon) = \exp \left[ \sum_{s=2}^{\infty} \frac{\hat{\zeta}_{2s-1}}{2s-1} p_{2s-1} \varepsilon^{2s-1} \right]$$

$$\hat{\zeta}_{2s-1} = \zeta_{2s-1} + \sum_{k=s}^{\infty} \zeta_{2k} \hat{C}_{2k, 2s-1} \varepsilon^{2(k-s)+1}$$

$$\hat{C}_{2k, 2s-1} = \frac{2s-1}{2k} C_{2k, 2s-1} = b_{2k-2s+1} \frac{(2k-1)!}{(2s-2)! (2k-2s+1)!}$$

$$b_{2m-1} = \frac{(2^{2m}-1)}{m} B_{2m}$$

**Note 1:** identical hatted  $\zeta$ -values found for the  $g$ -scale [Kotikov & ST '19]

**Note 2:** same basis found for scalar QED [Kotikov & ST '19]

# View of first terms generated by our exact result

In blue: terms known from [Baikov & Chetyrkin '18] (up to 6 loops).

In red: terms known from [Baikov & Chetyrkin '19] (7 loop).

$$\begin{aligned}\hat{\zeta}_3 &= \zeta_3 + \frac{3\epsilon}{2} \zeta_4 - \frac{5\epsilon^3}{2} \zeta_6 + \frac{21\epsilon^5}{2} \zeta_8 - \frac{153\epsilon^7}{2} \zeta_{10} + \frac{1705\epsilon^9}{2} \zeta_{12} - \frac{26949\epsilon^{11}}{2} \zeta_{14} + \frac{573405\epsilon^{13}}{2} \zeta_{16} - \\ &\quad - \frac{15802673\epsilon^{15}}{2} \zeta_{18} + \frac{547591761\epsilon^{17}}{2} \zeta_{20} - \frac{23302711005\epsilon^{19}}{2} \zeta_{22} + \frac{1194695479813\epsilon^{21}}{2} \zeta_{24} + \dots \\ \hat{\zeta}_5 &= \zeta_5 + \frac{5\epsilon}{2} \zeta_6 - \frac{35\epsilon^3}{4} \zeta_8 + 63\epsilon^5 \zeta_{10} - \frac{2805\epsilon^7}{4} \zeta_{12} + \frac{22165\epsilon^9}{2} \zeta_{14} - \frac{943215\epsilon^{11}}{4} \zeta_{16} + 6498590\epsilon^{13} \zeta_{18} - \\ &\quad - \frac{900752361\epsilon^{15}}{4} \zeta_{20} + \frac{19165711635\epsilon^{17}}{2} \zeta_{22} - \frac{1965195294755\epsilon^{19}}{4} \zeta_{24} + 29867386995325\epsilon^{21} \zeta_{26} + \dots \\ \hat{\zeta}_7 &= \zeta_7 + \frac{7\epsilon}{2} \zeta_8 - 21\epsilon^3 \zeta_{10} + 231\epsilon^5 \zeta_{12} - \frac{7293\epsilon^7}{2} \zeta_{14} + \frac{155155\epsilon^9}{2} \zeta_{16} - 2137954\epsilon^{11} \zeta_{18} + 74083926\epsilon^{13} \zeta_{20} + \dots \\ \hat{\zeta}_9 &= \zeta_9 + \frac{9\epsilon}{2} \zeta_{10} - \frac{165\epsilon^3}{4} \zeta_{12} + \frac{1287\epsilon^5}{2} \zeta_{14} - \frac{109395\epsilon^7}{8} \zeta_{16} + 376805\epsilon^9 \zeta_{18} - \frac{26113581\epsilon^{11}}{2} \zeta_{20} + \dots \\ \hat{\zeta}_{11} &= \zeta_{11} + \frac{11\epsilon}{2} \zeta_{12} - \frac{143\epsilon^3}{2} \zeta_{14} + \frac{3003\epsilon^5}{2} \zeta_{16} - 41327\epsilon^7 \zeta_{18} + 1431859\epsilon^9 \zeta_{20} - 60931689\epsilon^{11} \zeta_{22} + \dots \\ \hat{\zeta}_{13} &= \zeta_{13} + \frac{13\epsilon}{2} \zeta_{14} - \frac{455\epsilon^3}{4} \zeta_{16} + 3094\epsilon^5 \zeta_{18} - \frac{214149\epsilon^7}{2} \zeta_{20} + 4555915\epsilon^9 \zeta_{22} - \frac{467142949\epsilon^{11}}{2} \zeta_{24} + \dots \\ \hat{\zeta}_{15} &= \zeta_{15} + \frac{15\epsilon}{2} \zeta_{16} - 170\epsilon^3 \zeta_{18} + 5814\epsilon^5 \zeta_{20} - 247095\epsilon^7 \zeta_{22} + 12666445\epsilon^9 \zeta_{24} - 770015850\epsilon^{11} \zeta_{26} + \dots\end{aligned}$$

# Outline

1 Introduction

2 Proof

3 Conclusion

# Conclusion

- 1 our work **clarifies** the  $\zeta$ -structure of gauge field theories (proof of “no- $\pi$  theorem”, exact formula valid to all orders of perturbation theory),
- 2 provides **stringent constraints** (allowing important checks) on present and future multi-loop results.
- 3 minimal Vladimirov-scheme should prove itself of **very convenient** use in multi-loop calculations.

Multi- $\hat{\zeta}$  values: open issue!

# Conclusion

- 1 our work **clarifies** the  $\zeta$ -structure of gauge field theories (proof of “no- $\pi$  theorem”, exact formula valid to all orders of perturbation theory),
- 2 provides **stringent constraints** (allowing important checks) on present and future multi-loop results.
- 3 minimal Vladimirov-scheme should prove itself of **very convenient** use in multi-loop calculations.

Multi- $\hat{\zeta}$  values: open issue!